Abstract

Whether to grant lucrative hospitals tax-exempt status is a controversial legal topic. Under the current law, non-profits must provide community benefit, a specific type of charitable giving, to maintain their tax-exempt status. The goal of this paper is to argue that hospitals’ community benefit requirement should be strengthened and further specified. I plan to show that the non-profit hospitals can afford charitable contributions to surrounding communities, but such contributions are a small share of their expenditures. I propose two easy steps can be made to make the community benefit requirement meaningful.

The Problem

As of now, hardly any non-profit hospitals provide charitable giving, to maintain their tax-exempt status. Under the current law, non-profit hospitals must provide community benefit: This is defined as a reduction in the costs of health care. The Community Health Benefits Law requires non-profit hospitals to make community benefit report every three years with an implementation progress report. However, there is no one holding them accountable in completing the goals and ideas set forth in the Community Needs Assessment. Adding accountability should increase the odds goals are met. Moreover, if we give hospitals a more defined outline of what investments truly bring community benefit there will be less uncertainty and misuse of funds.

As shown above, actual charity care only accounts for just over 1% of total hospital expenditures and 9% of their community benefit expenditures. Reason to them maintain their tax-exempt status:

1. Community benefits non-profit hospitals provide may outweigh the foregone tax revenue. For instance, the ratio of community benefit to Federal tax forgone is 11:1.
2. Removing their tax-exempt status may cause these hospitals to pull out of lower income areas and move to more affluent ones creating a massive loss of availability to emergency care.
3. Many of these non-profit hospitals provide the vast majority of the jobs available in the surrounding communities. Mayo Clinic provides 167,000 jobs nationwide.

Possible Solutions

Add accountability to the Community Needs Assessment Right now, every Non-Profit Hospital has to do a community needs assessment every three years. However, there is no accountability to achieve those goals they make and ideas they have. Research shows that adding accountability increases the chance you will achieve your goals by up to 95% if done right, according to the American Society of Training and Development. This can be done a few ways:

1. Require an implementation report every year
2. Set a percentage of goals that must be met to maintain tax-exempt status
3. Create an independent department whose purpose is to help hospitals define SMART goals in their assessment.

Give Directions on Re-investment of Profits

As seen above, many Non-Profit Hospitals make good profits. Those profits tend to be used in ways similar to For-Profit Institutions. Guidelines should be set up to direct the usage of those profits towards investments that reflect the primary goal of serving, improving, and creating communities that allow flourishing. As an example, here are some ways that could be used to increase the efficient use of their resources:

1. Set a minimum percentage of operating expenses that have to be put towards community upbuilding activities.
2. Push for more upstream investments that attempt to tackle the root of the issues noted in the CNHA.
3. Set a ceiling on executive and administrative pay at market value.

As seen above, actual charity care only accounts for just over 1% of total hospital expenditures and 9% of their community benefit expenditures. Reason to them maintain their tax-exempt status:

1. Community benefits non-profit hospitals provide may outweigh the foregone tax revenue. For instance, the ratio of community benefit to Federal tax forgone is 11:1.
2. Removing their tax-exempt status may cause these hospitals to pull out of lower income areas and move to more affluent ones creating a massive loss of availability to emergency care.
3. Many of these non-profit hospitals provide the vast majority of the jobs available in the surrounding communities. Mayo Clinic provides 167,000 jobs nationwide.

Possible Solutions

Add accountability to the Community Needs Assessment Right now, every Non-Profit Hospital has to do a community needs assessment every three years. However, there is no accountability to achieve those goals they make and ideas they have. Research shows that adding accountability increases the chance you will achieve your goals by up to 95% if done right, according to the American Society of Training and Development. This can be done a few ways:

1. Require an implementation report every year
2. Set a percentage of goals that must be met to maintain tax-exempt status
3. Create an independent department whose purpose is to help hospitals define SMART goals in their assessment.

Give Directions on Re-investment of Profits

As seen above, many Non-Profit Hospitals make good profits. Those profits tend to be used in ways similar to For-Profit Institutions. Guidelines should be set up to direct the usage of those profits towards investments that reflect the primary goal of serving, improving, and creating communities that allow flourishing. As an example, here are some ways that could be used to increase the efficient use of their resources:

1. Set a minimum percentage of operating expenses that have to be put towards community upbuilding activities.
2. Push for more upstream investments that attempt to tackle the root of the issues noted in the CNHA.
3. Set a ceiling on executive and administrative pay at market value.

Is it Worth Fixing?

As seen above, actual charity care only accounts for just over 1% of total hospital expenditures and 9% of their community benefit expenditures. Reasons to let them maintain their tax-exempt status:

1. Too many non-profit hospitals operate the same as for-profit hospitals. They operate for profit maximization, which should make them for-profit status with taxes.
2. Taking their status away would force non-profit hospitals to become more efficient with spending and investments. For instance, it would also cause them to re-evaluate their inefficient branches, which may have social benefits.
3. As of now, hardly any non-profit hospital provides enough community benefit or charity to justify tax exempt status. And clarifying community benefit rules may prove to be too difficult.

Conclusion

Non-profit hospitals are as big and profitable as for-profit hospitals. Their spending patterns are similar as well. However, preliminary results suggest that taking away their tax-exempt status may not be socially optimal because their “community benefits” may outweigh the foregone tax revenue. The question became how we can reconcile their tax-exempt status with their profits. Under the current law, there is no one holding them accountable in completing the goals and ideas set forth in the Community Needs Assessment. Adding accountability should increase the odds goals are met. Moreover, if we give hospitals a more defined outline of what investments truly bring community benefit there will be less uncertainty and misuse of funds.

7. Catholic Health Association of the United States
8. Mayo Clinic

Acknowledgment

This poster represents ongoing research starting in this semester. I would like to thank Professor Fei for his patience and guidance throughout the process. I intend to continue working on this project for my Honors thesis.